

2008

Review of People of the Volcano. Andean Counterpoint in the Colca Valley of Peru

Maria Marsilli

John Carroll University, mmarsilli@jcu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <http://collected.jcu.edu/hist-facpub>



Part of the [Latin American History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Marsilli, Maria, "Review of People of the Volcano. Andean Counterpoint in the Colca Valley of Peru" (2008). *History*. 18.
<http://collected.jcu.edu/hist-facpub/18>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by Carroll Collected. It has been accepted for inclusion in History by an authorized administrator of Carroll Collected. For more information, please contact connell@jcu.edu.

Short Notices

Noble David Cook with Alexandra Parma Cook, *People of the Volcano. Andean Counterpoint in the Colca Valley of Peru* (2007), 319 (Duke University Press, Durham, \$84.95).

Cook traces the challenges faced by *Collaguas* and *Cabanas*, the original inhabitants of the Colca Valley in southern Peru, from pre-Hispanic times to the early seventeenth century. Although mindful of environmental transformations, his investigation, Cook asserts, aims at exploring the social foundations that permitted the natives to survive in a difficult environment that the Spanish conquest rendered especially challenging.

The first chapter describes the *Collaguas* and *Cabanas*' pre-Hispanic social and economic organization, and also documents the natives' cosmology and explains the direct, total control of the area that the Incan elite accomplished by late pre-Hispanic times. The second chapter illustrates the first encounters between Andeans and Spaniards in the Colca Valley. It documents the first *encomiendas* and the impact that this early form of labour coercion had upon native society. The chapter also details the initial clash between Christianity and native religion, as early agents of Catholicism rushed to destroy all expressions of pre-Hispanic beliefs.

Chapter three describes the disruption that the civil wars and debates about the perpetuity of *encomiendas* among Spaniards caused in the new colony. Such turmoil was mirrored among Andeans, according to Cook, by the eruption of a nativist movement known as *Taqui Onqoy*. The next chapter carefully details Francisco de Toledo's *reducciones* policy and its impact on the Colca Valley. According to Cook, the spirit of the plan, turning Andeans into docile Spanish citizens useful to back an imperial regime, carried the seeds of its failure. For Indians, he asserts, 'the true Andean utopia meant the return to [their] pre-Inca past, when local *ayllus* and ethnic units were autonomous' (104).

Chapters five and six detail the social and economic pressure that the colonial system imposed upon *Collaguas* and *Cabanas*. This view is complemented in chapter seven, which explains the strains that forced labour drafts (*mita*) caused among the native groups. According to Cook, such an economic system accelerated Indian migration, poverty and environmental degradation.

Chapter eight highlights the early conversion efforts accomplished in the valley by mendicant orders, particularly the Franciscans. The Andean response to these efforts can be observed by the late sixteenth century, Cook claims, when Peruvian clergy discovered some cases of Andean 'idolatry' in the area, a finding that confirmed the resilience of native religion. The final chapter explains the economic and social decline that *encomenderos* in the Colca

Valley experienced by the early seventeenth century. The crisis was aggravated by natural disasters such as earthquakes, and recurrent plagues which caused a sharp Indian population decline.

Cook's study is based upon solid archival data and scholarly research accomplished by the author over several decades. It constitutes an insightful, well-documented analysis of the impact of the Spanish conquest upon a specific valley and its native groups. Not surprisingly, Cook's proposals can easily be applied to the whole Andean region and to major areas of colonial Latin America.

María N. Marsilli
John Carroll University, Ohio
© 2008, María N. Marsilli

Laura L. Lovett, *Conceiving the Future: Pronatalism, Reproduction, and the Family in the United States, 1890–1938* (2007), xi + 236 (University of North Carolina Press, Chapel Hill, \$59.95, paperback \$19.95).

Laura D. Lovett's book examines the social policy agendas of five historical figures whose ideas influenced public thinking about the social purposes of human reproduction. She argues that the period from 1890 to 1938 was one in which 'nostalgic idealizations of motherhood, the family, and home were used to construct and legitimate political agendas and social policies concerning reproduction' in the United States (3). More specifically, this marked a time in which a cadre of social reformers asserted that the nation's 'traditional stock' – white, Anglo-Saxon Protestants – was in danger of losing numerical (and therefore social and political) dominance due to their falling birth rates, while those of recent immigrants from southern and eastern Europe and Asia were believed to be higher. From this shared premise, reformers debated what could and should be done. Lovett argues that both the framing of the problem itself and the solutions proposed to address it were predicated on a belief that American society had moved dangerously away from its agrarian roots, a tradition that had, at its centre, the 'hearty pioneer family' whose vigour, strength and moral integrity had served to shape the nation's cherished democratic ideals (12). Lovett labels these reformers 'nostalgic modernists' because they drew from an idealized notion of the past in formulating an array of coercive pronatalist policies and programmes that were intended to shape their society's future.

The five figures Lovett has chosen represent both a chronological and an ideological range within the broader paradigm she has drawn: the Populism of Mary Elizabeth Lease, George H. Maxwell's Homecroft Movement, Edward A. Ross's 'race suicide' theory, Theodore Roosevelt's promotion of conservationism and Florence Sherbon's popular eugenics. Each is the focus of a separate, largely self-contained chapter. The virtue of this approach is that Lovett can take her subjects seriously on their own terms, offering a finely tuned analysis of each figure's ideas as well as the specific movement he or she represents. The primary drawback is that the reader is left with a series of intellectual portraits rather than a fully developed historical picture. In the end, I was not convinced of either the ultimate significance or the expressly coercive nature of many of the social policies her subjects promoted. Nevertheless, Lovett's careful examination of these five distinctive yet interrelated strands of pronatalist thought

significantly enriches our understanding of the United States as it struggled with modernity in the early twentieth century.

Lynne Curry
 Eastern Illinois University
 © 2008, Lynne Curry

Trevor Dean, *Crime and Justice in Late Medieval Italy* (2007), ix + 226 (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge and New York, £55.00/\$90.00).

Crime and Justice in Late Medieval Italy takes a wide-angle view of crime in all of Italy through a profusion of diverse sources, some legal and some not specifically so. While it does some comparative analysis, it mainly uses sources of different kinds and from different places in an effort to build up a general picture of crime and its remedies. The book is interested in the treatment of both social history from criminal records and legal history, and it avoids the complaint of legal historians against social history of being insufficiently cognizant of the legal purpose of the cases employed. Dean grounds his history more than sufficiently in legal sources, in which he has obvious great expertise. He is amazingly effective at cutting to the quick concerning the identification of contemporary legal problems and their solutions without becoming encumbered by the burdensome apparatus of Roman law. In the section on *consilia*, for example, which in my opinion is the best chapter, he is able to tap into practical discussions that attempted to resolve issues arising out of contumacy (extra-territoriality and banning), accusation and jurisdiction. The least successful chapters are those on chronicles and literature, which are sparse and inconclusive. Criteria for deciding which sources should be included are indefinite. Can we use the description of the court system from Bruni's *Laudatio*?

Call me old-fashioned, but I do not see why he does not give credit to the *ius commune* as a unifying force, since this would lend further legitimacy to an Italian-wide undertaking. He appears stumped by what law is described as encompassing more than one city (146). This is especially quixotic since he is fully fluent in *ius commune* sources. Recognizing the *ius commune* would also explain why more crimes were being punished than those regarded as criminal by the statute law (5).

A book of this scope should not be nitpicked, so I apologize for the following nitpicking comments. In chapter one, Dean should note that the private mechanisms he discusses are under the supervision of the state and used by the state. Concerning chapter six, I would put more credence in private vendetta. Baldus is correct that vendetta is permitted in Florence in restricted circumstances; it is still permitted in the 1415 statutes (III, CXX and III, CXXI). Cases of using vendetta as a defence against a homicide charge do exist in Florence (Atti del Podesta, 4372, case of Johannes and Jacobus Michaelis of Castro Scarparia) (126). Is Florence the rule or the exception? Considerations of honour were based on noble pedigree, noble nostalgia and the laws of war. Venice enacted a feudal code in 1770. Trial by battle ended in England in 1819.

Dean's book is a slice of Renaissance life. Put on your jogging shoes. This book is frantically paced and runs us by an amazing array of cities, laws, criminal cases, narratives and humanity.

Laura Stern
 University of North Texas
 © 2008, Laura Stern

Copyright of Social History is the property of Routledge and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.