

---

**History**

---

Winter 2009

## **Review of The Indian Split: Fractures of Consciousness in the Colonial Philippines; Critical Edition and Study of the Symposia of the Truth of Pedro De Quiroga**

Maria Marsilli

*John Carroll University*, [mmarsilli@jcu.edu](mailto:mmarsilli@jcu.edu)

Follow this and additional works at: <https://collected.jcu.edu/hist-facpub>

 Part of the [History Commons](#)

---

### **Recommended Citation**

Marsilli, Maria, "Review of The Indian Split: Fractures of Consciousness in the Colonial Philippines; Critical Edition and Study of the Symposia of the Truth of Pedro De Quiroga" (2009). *History*. 4.  
<https://collected.jcu.edu/hist-facpub/4>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by Carroll Collected. It has been accepted for inclusion in History by an authorized administrator of Carroll Collected. For more information, please contact [mchercourt@jcu.edu](mailto:mchercourt@jcu.edu).

Catholic position in order to smooth over the disagreement with the Protestants over the doctrine of justification had also the objective of supporting and strengthening imperial positions against the French-Ottoman alliance: neither the relationship with the pope was to be severed nor a war against the German Protestants begun.

The great novelty of Crews's study lies in this interpretation of Juan de Valdés's religious and literary work. While previous research saw the influence of Erasmian, Alumbrado, Protestant, and laicist positions on Valdés the Catholic reformer, Crews takes these individual impacts on the humanist in consideration, but subordinates them completely to Valdés's political interest on behalf of the Spanish monarchy. Only Valdés's relationship to Giulia Gonzaga — and at this point we have come full circle — stands outside of this model. He defended her interests in cases that did not amuse Spanish politicians. He also dedicated religious writings to her that were written without any ecclesiastical or political motivation and that had only the purpose to help his friend who was suffering from depression. At this point Crews raises the question of "what Juan de Valdés 'really' believed in" (169). Crews believes that to solve this enigma is beyond the scope of his study, but he is convinced that Valdés's heterodoxy was connected inextricably with political service. His religious performances were not seen as heretical in the eyes of his contemporaries, as Crews emphasizes. Valdés and his proponents were sentenced as heretics only after his death.

MARTIN BIRSACK

University of Regensburg

Ana Vian Herrero. *El indio dividido: Fracturas de conciencia en el Perú colonial; Edición crítica y estudio de los Coloquios de la verdad de Pedro de Quiroga*.

Madrid: Iberoamericana Vervuert, 2009. 572 pp. index. bibl. \$69.57. ISBN: 978-84-8489-393-6.

Vian Herrero presents the latest, comprehensive study and edition of *Los Coloquios de la verdad*, one of the earliest primary sources on the spiritual conquest of the Andes. The text was written around 1560 by Spanish clergyman Pedro de Quiroga, possibly a Franciscan friar with extensive experience in the conversion of Andean peoples to Catholicism. Quiroga organized his text as a dialogue between Barquilón, a former Spanish conqueror turned hermit; Justino, a Spanish soldier recently arrived in Peru; and Tito, an Indian of Incan descent. Specialists have long viewed Quiroga's prose as elegant and compelling and praised the text as one of the first literary accomplishments in the New World.

Vian Herrero builds on previous studies of the source, in particular Daisy Ripodas Ardananz's *Coloquios de la verdad* (1999). As a result, the author provides a knowledgeable, engaging contextualization of Quiroga's biography, the political momentum in the Peruvian Viceroyalty, and the conundrums of the evangelical enterprise in the Andes by mid-sixteenth century. Vian Herrero emphasizes the

importance of dating the text by 1560, shortly prior to the eruption of the nativist movement known as Taqui Onqoy. Viewed by scholars as the Indian religious response to the first impact of the Spanish conquest, this movement made apparent the instability of the colony's political and religious organization. In response, the Spanish crown implemented the 1570 Toledan reforms, a comprehensive plan to secure a more forceful approach to Indian conversion and a complete reform of the natives' daily life. Quiroga's text, Vian Herrero observes, is then crucial to understanding not only the early years of European influence in the Andes but also the actual nature of Spanish colonization.

Vian Herrero pays detailed attention to the text. First, she explores the importance of dialogue as a narrative technique in early modern European literature, both in Spain and the New World. Clergymen in the colonies greatly favored the use of fictional dialogues as narrative settings, the author observes, because the resulting texts could be used as theater plays, that is, as catechism tools in Indian conversion. Quiroga's selection of this narrative protocol is therefore hardly surprising. The novelty of the text, Vian Herrero remarks, lies in Quiroga's unapologetic embrace of the Lascasian paradigm, the sixteenth-century philosophical defense of Indian rights and culture. The missionary based his narrative upon the natives' viewpoint to describe and understand past and present events. In so doing, Vian Herrero points out, *Los Coloquios de la verdad* provides specialists with an invaluable tool for understanding the conquest and colonization of the New World from the natives' perspective.

Vian Herrero meticulously analyzes linguistic components of the text. For instance, she connects the narrative plots used in the speech of two main characters, Barquilon and Tito, to contemporary and classical literary influences in vogue in Spain. Additionally, the author provides an engaging analysis of the rhetorical schemes that Quiroga used throughout his text and connects them to the influence of Erasmus in Spanish literature. Finally, Vian Herrero examines the speech of Tito, the recently Hispanicized Indian in the story. According to her, the character's trilingualism (Spanish, Quechua, and Latin) is indicative of the far-reaching implications of Quiroga's standpoint on Indian conversion. For the clergyman, Indians who had been recently exposed to European languages had the potential to become fluent only after a few years. According to Vian Herrero, this demonstrates Quiroga's confidence in the natural aptitude of Andeans to become both good Christians and full subjects of the Spanish empire (273).

The original text is then presented with meticulous, easy-to-read annotations that provide readers with detailed information about the manuscript, relevant contemporary and modern bibliography, and linguistic analysis. Transcription from the original is carefully presented and easy to grasp, even for nonspecialists. In sum, this is a valuable primary source for the study of early colonial Peru and an essential text for understanding the early evangelical enterprise in the Americas.

MARÍA N. MARSILLI  
John Carroll University