

12-1-1995

Review of Images of Sanctity in Eddius Stephanus 'Life of Bishop Wilfrid', an Early English Saints Life, by W.T. Foley

Joseph F. Kelly

John Carroll University, kelly@jcu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://collected.jcu.edu/theo_rels-facpub



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Kelly, Joseph F., "Review of Images of Sanctity in Eddius Stephanus 'Life of Bishop Wilfrid', an Early English Saints Life, by W.T. Foley" (1995). *Theology & Religious Studies*. 18.

http://collected.jcu.edu/theo_rels-facpub/18

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by Carroll Collected. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theology & Religious Studies by an authorized administrator of Carroll Collected. For more information, please contact connell@jcu.edu.

omits the Greek East and chronologically concentrates on the fifth and sixth centuries rather than on the fourth and fifth centuries. This leads then to his reason for concentrating on St. Martin of Tours ("the best-documented cult in the late antique West") and Gregory of Tours, who "collected hundreds of miracle stories about the saint and his cult." The latter activity when combined with Gregory's *Historiae* (its popular title is "History of the Franks") make him the most important contemporary observer and commentator in late antique Gaul.

The result of Van Dam's efforts is, indeed, a finely nuanced study clearly and intensively focused on an era and an area which in many ways was the incubator for early-medieval Western Christianity.

The narrative and the translations are supported by detailed and informative footnotes, plus an itemizing of "Editions and Translations" (pp. 319–320), a bibliography (pp. 323–334), a map of late antique Gaul (p. 335), and an excellent twelve-page index.

Colorado State University
Fort Collins, Colorado

HARRY ROSENBERG

Images of Sanctity in Eddius Stephanus' Life of Bishop Wilfrid, an Early English Saint's Life. By WILLIAM T. FOLEY. Lewiston, N. Y.: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1992. x + 174 pp. \$79.95.

As the title indicates, this book studies another book, Eddius Stephanus' *Life of Bishop Wilfrid*, written in approximately 715 about the controversial Northumbrian bishop, Wilfrid of York (634–709). Foley accepts the hagiographical nature of the *vita* and concentrates on how Stephanus presents Wilfrid as a saint.

Foley opens with a discussion of hagiography which is helpful but superfluous in parts since only specialists who have read the *vita* will read this book. When he turns to typology, the author moves to surer ground, demonstrating effectively the Pauline schema behind the *vita*'s overall structure. He uses this approach convincingly to explain why this *vita* differs from other Anglo-Saxon hagiography (p. 43). The attempt to link the Pauline schema to the Roman tradition (pp. 49–52) needs more development and is unconvincing.

Equally unconvincing is the image of Wilfrid as the *pater pater*. Foley simply takes the supposed biblical foundation too far: "For the image of the father, when applied to humans, always carries with it the danger of idolatry, 'And call no man your father on earth, for you have one Father, who is in heaven' (Matt. 23:9)" (p. 57). Clearly this verse carried no weight in a church whose members addressed the clergy as Father.

On the other hand, the author's analysis of Wilfrid's self-understanding as a persecuted bishop in the Lyons-Rome model opens up a new understanding of both Stephanus and his subject. Foley argues that the young saint's

presence in these two cities at times when their bishops endured persecution impressed upon him the image of what a bishop must be—one who suffers for his flock and for the rights of his church. This made both the historical and hagiographical Wilfrid a distinctly non-Northumbrian bishop and caused so many of his contemporaries to misjudge him. Indeed, not only did his contemporaries misjudge him but so has history. Foley contends that modern scholars, following their much venerated Bede, have bought into the view that the northern, eremitic Cuthbert truly exemplifies Northumbrian sanctity while the Romanized, episcopal Wilfrid could not. This is an excellent point, and one which Anglo-Saxonists must take seriously.

The highly focused nature of this book as well as its price will limit its appeal, but specialists will find it helpful.

John Carroll University
Cleveland, Ohio

JOSEPH F. KELLY

The Last Christology of the West: Adoptionism in Spain and Gaul, 785–820. By JOHN C. CAVADINI. The Middle Ages Series. Philadelphia, Pa.: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1993. xii + 235 pp. \$36.95.

Students of the history of Christian doctrine know that sometime in the early Middle Ages some deservedly obscure Spanish theologians revived Nestorianism as a minor heresy called adoptionism and were refuted by Alcuin. At best, adoptionism merits a footnote while scholars turn to more important matters.

Cavadini demonstrates that this too common view emerged from deficient scholarship. For generations scholars relied not upon investigations of the relevant texts but rather upon the opinion of Alcuin (a Romanized Englishman and a Carolingian and thus a mainstream thinker) that the Spanish theologians Elipandus of Toledo and Felix of Urgel were immature intellectuals who possibly did not even realize the Nestorian content of their teaching. He argues that a serious encounter with the texts reveals that the Spaniards were creative theologians who worked within a Western context. Unfortunately for them, their critics, who knew little of the Spanish environment, chose to recontextualize their works into an Eastern framework, that is, to assume that the only Christology was that of Ephesus and Chalcedon and thus to condemn the Spaniards as Nestorians.

Cavadini argues that Elipandus, living in Muslim territory, tried to keep alive the traditions of Spanish Christianity and its North African roots. His adoptionism grew from this and not, as many scholars have maintained, from his desire to accommodate his Muslim overlords by playing down the trinitarian nature of Christian belief. Cavadini demonstrates that Elipandus vigorously stood by his Christianity to the Muslims and that his adoptionism