

9-1-1986

Review of Goad and Nail, E.R. Elder, Editor

Joseph F. Kelly

John Carroll University, kelly@jcu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://collected.jcu.edu/theo_rels-facpub



Part of the [Religion Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Kelly, Joseph F., "Review of Goad and Nail, E.R. Elder, Editor" (1986). *Theology & Religious Studies*. 7.
http://collected.jcu.edu/theo_rels-facpub/7

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by Carroll Collected. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theology & Religious Studies by an authorized administrator of Carroll Collected. For more information, please contact connell@jcu.edu.

five, Zimdars-Swartz offers an important and extended consideration of Joachim's interpretation of the Incarnation and of the relation between Christ and the Holy Spirit. The selected bibliography introduces the reader to the basic literature on Joachim and his influence.

In general, one may say positively of this book that it will serve as a ready introduction to Joachim's thought. However, with some exceptions, it finally falls short of expressing adequately the complexity of the Abbot's thought with the subtlety needed to interpret it.

Oberlin College
Oberlin, Ohio

GROVER A. ZINN, JR.

Goad and Nail. Edited by E. ROZANNE ELDER. Studies in Medieval Cistercian History 10. Kalamazoo: Cistercian Publications, 1985. vii + 299 pp.

This volume is the latest in a quickly growing series. It contains papers from the 1983 and 1984 Conference on Cistercian Studies, sponsored by the Institute of Cistercian Studies, Kalamazoo, and includes contributions by scholars from seven countries (though all entries are in English). It displays the inevitable range of quality and interest, with some papers appealing solely to specialists, others to medievalists in general. Many of the papers deal with spirituality; this review will concentrate on those dealing with church history.

Gerhard Jaritz offers an interesting and well-documented look at "The Standard of Living in German and Austrian Cistercian Monasteries in the Late Middle Ages." He demonstrates how the initial rigor of the order declined, not because of the corruption lamented by reformers, but because of the need to deal with the secular world and the consequent desire to fit into that world. He itemizes diets and inventories of clothing to prove his point. The same author also studies Cistercian migrations in the Late Middle Ages and proves that the migrating monks were not the *gyrovagues* so excoriated by Benedict, but monks who responded to incidents in their monasteries and who "followed quite explicit principles" (p. 196) in the direction of their travels.

Chrysogonus Waddell challenges established notions about the origins of the Citeaux liturgy by suggesting the abbey of Marmoutier as a source. In a rather brief contribution, Werner Rösener contends that Abbot Stephen Lexington of Clairvaux worked successfully to blend *spiritualia* and *temporalia*, and that his success deserves more study. B.P. McGuire argues that Eskil, Archbishop of Lund (1138-1177), supported the Cistercians in Scandinavia because Bernard of Clairvaux's notions of spiritual friendship and the afterlife provided Eskil with a positive counterweight to the

prevailing harshness of Scandinavian Christianity. Thus this volume contains ample material for the church historian.

The book's major drawback results from sloppy editing. For example, capitalization is not uniform. On page 252 there is a "cistercian" house, but on the same page are "Cistercian" monasteries; on page 260 are "french" and "French"; on page 141 we find "German," but "german" on page 255. On the topic of adjectives, the influence of Bernard of Clairvaux is "bernardian" on page 186 and "bernardine" on page 253. These may seem like small points, but it is distracting to read a book that uses two different spellings, even on the same page, for a single word. This frustrating medium prevents the message from getting through.

John Carroll University
Cleveland, Ohio

JOSEPH F. KELLY

Eucharistic Presence and Conversion in Late Thirteenth-Century Franciscan Thought. By DAVID BURR. Transactions of the American Philosophical Society 74, Part 3. Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1984. ii + 113 pp. \$12.00.

Professor Burr admits from the outset that his study deals with a rather arcane topic in medieval theology: the way Franciscan theologians from Bonaventure to John Duns Scotus resolved the question of the dependence of the real presence of Christ in the eucharist on the conversion of the elements of bread and wine into his body and blood. According to Burr, by the middle of the thirteenth century a thesis had been developed, chiefly by Bonaventure and Thomas Aquinas, which saw in the doctrine of transubstantiation "both an adequate and necessary explanation of the eucharistic presence" (p. 15).

However, this theory was to be subjected to severe criticism in the latter part of the thirteenth century by a series of Franciscan theologians. Although Duns Scotus rightly has received the lion's share of attention for his tightly argued thesis, other lesser-known theologians provided the beginning of this critique, and the real contribution of Burr's study lies in his focusing our attention on them. Beginning with William de la Mare in the late 1260s, these revisionists developed arguments denying the necessity of the theory of transubstantiation to explain the eucharistic presence. Burr rightly situates their views as part of a whole counterattack against the perceived threat of an overweening Aristotelian rationalism. Thus these Franciscan theologians continually appeal to divine omnipotence to argue that Christ could be really present in the eucharist without any conversion taking place at all. Transubstantiation well might be the correct doctrine, but its validity rests on the authority of the church, not on its rational necessity.

This study makes for very difficult reading, due to an admitted "atomizing